Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs

WIDA PRIME Correlation

WIDA PRIME Correlation Process

WIDA ELP Standards
WIDA Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs
WIDA PRIME Correlation Form for Educators

Introduction
The Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs (PRIME) has been developed by World-Class Instructional Design and Assessment (WIDA) to assist educators and publishers in examining the representation of key elements of the WIDA English language proficiency standards in their materials.

The intent of this review is for users to identify the ways in which elements of the WIDA English Language Proficiency Standards, 2007 Edition, PreKindergarten through Grade 12 are represented in instructional materials. These materials vary from core or supplemental texts to DVDs to software programs; however, it is assumed that they all seek to provide teachers with standards-based references to use with English language learners in diverse settings across the United States.

The Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs (PRIME) is not an evaluative tool aimed to judge the effectiveness of published materials using the WIDA English Language Proficiency (ELP) Standards. The goal of the Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs (PRIME) is twofold:

- to assist educators in making informed decisions in selecting instructional materials for programs serving English language learners and
- to aid publishers and correlators in developing materials and communicating how their materials address key elements of the WIDA English Language Proficiency Standards

Organization
The Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs (PRIME) is organized into two parts that together are intended to provide information about instructional materials in each of 14 criteria. Part 1 contains information about the materials that are to be reviewed. Part 2 is the protocol used for the review of instructional materials and includes space for page number examples and responses to the questions. An Appendix at the end of the document provides definitions of the categories included in the PRIME correlation.

Please note that the questions contained in this form are identical to those in the completed correlations on our website.

Directions for completing the Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs (PRIME) inventory:

**STEP 1:** Complete information about materials being reviewed.

**STEP 2:** Respond to the “Yes/No” questions about the presence of the criteria in the materials.

**STEP 3:** Provide justification to support your “Yes” responses. (Note: If additional explanation for “No” answers is relevant to readers’ understanding of the materials, this may also be included.)
Organization of the WIDA English Language Proficiency Standards In Relation to the Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs

The 14 PRIME criteria are in **BOLD** below.

### I. Performance Definitions
(Criteria that shape the ELP Standards)
- IA. Linguistic Complexity
- IB. Vocabulary Usage
- IC. Language Control/Conventions

### II. English Language Proficiency Standards
- IIA. Presence of WIDA ELP Standards
- IIB. Representation of Language Domains (Listening, Speaking, Reading, Writing)

### III. Levels of English Language Proficiency
(Entering, Beginning, Developing, Expanding, Bridging)
- IIIA. Differentiation of Language
- IIIB. Scaffolding Language Development

### IV. Strands of Model Performance Indicators
- IVA. Language Functions
  - Attached to Context
  - Higher Order Thinking
- IVB. Content Stem
  - Coverage and Specificity of Example Topics
  - Accessibility to Grade Level Content
- IVC. Instructional Supports
  - Sensory Support
  - Graphic Support
  - Interactive Support
Part 1: Information About Materials

Publication Title(s): Early Explorers

Publisher: Benchmark Education Company

Materials/ Program to be Reviewed: Early Explorers

Tools of Instruction included in this review: Student books in both English and Spanish, Teacher’s Guides, talking e-book books on Interactive Whiteboard

Intended Teacher Audiences: Elementary Classroom Teachers, Title I Teachers, ELL/Bilingual/Migrant Teachers, Pre-K Teachers, Special Education Teachers, Instructional Coaches, After-School Tutors, Dual Language Programs

Intended Student Audiences: P-2 students, ELL/Migrant/Bilingual students, Title I students, Special Education students, Struggling Readers

WIDA Framework(s) considered: Summative and Formative

Language domains addressed in material: Listening, Speaking, Reading, Writing

WIDA English Language Proficiency Standards addressed: 1) Social and Instructional, 2) Language of Language Arts, 3) Language of Mathematics, 4) Language of Science, 5) Language of Social Studies

WIDA language proficiency levels included: 1 (Entering), 2 (Beginning), 3 (Developing), 4 (Expanding)

Most Recently Published Edition or Website: www.benchmarkeducation.com

In the space below explain the focus or intended use of the materials.

Early Explorers leveled texts are designed for use in small-group reading and/or language instruction to meet the needs of students of diverse reading and language proficiency levels. Small-group instruction can be in the classroom as part of small-group instruction or as part of whole-group differentiated instruction; they can also be for use in special programs that supplement or provide accommodations for the regular classroom; they can be used for after-school enrichment programs, ELL programs, and/or tutoring programs.

Early Explorers links language acquisition to literacy development with built-in language, vocabulary, and comprehension scaffolds representing Mathematics, Science, and Social Studies topics. Benchmark Education provides instructional materials that span all of the WIDA Levels of Language Proficiency. These are: Levels 1-4: Early Explorers, English Explorers Science and Social Studies, Math Explorers

Level 5: Bridges

Level 6: Navigators

All of these materials are designed to support the English Language Learner through the Levels of Language Proficiency with a variety of complexity, scaffolds, structure, and challenge with a strong focus on subject-specific content and academic vocabulary.

This correlation addresses: Early Explorers. The full version can be found at www.benchmarkeducation.com.
Part 2: PRIME Correlation Tool

I. PERFORMANCE DEFINITIONS

IA. Linguistic Complexity (the amount and quality of speech or writing)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| ✅ | ❌ | A. Do the instructional materials take into account linguistic complexity for language learners?
| ✅ | ❌ | B. Do the instructional materials address linguistic complexity for all of the targeted proficiency levels?
| ✅ | ❌ | C. Is linguistic complexity systematically addressed, in multiple lessons, chapters, or units, in the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

(A) The Early Explorers series provides a scaffolded progression of reading development and language acquisition that incorporates the range of linguistic complexity as defined in the WIDA ELP Standards. (B) Each text in the Early Explorer series provides scaffolding—visual vocabulary introduction, captions and labels, sidebars, a graphic organizer, and a picture glossary—so that all levels of students can access the same content at all WIDA levels. (C) The linguistic complexity is systematically designed around the characteristics of the first four WIDA levels and included in texts and teacher’s guides.

Level 1 (Entering) books include visual vocabulary introduction, 1-2 sentences of up to 6 words, and simple repetitive sentence structure with direct image support. Concepts are pictorially reviewed at the end of each book.
Example: "Families Have Rules" - “This family has a rule. The rule is ‘Make your bed’.” (pg. 6)

Level 2 (Beginning) texts books keep to a few simple sentence structures and simple real-world contexts. Teaching points (big ideas) and visual vocabulary are introduced prior to reading the book. Features include some repetitive, sentences, 1-4 sentences per page, up to 6 words in most sentences, and high photo support. Example: "Rules at School" - “We do our work at school. We give our work to the teacher. Then we get time to play.” (pg. 6)

Level 3 (Developing) texts introduce a few compound sentences and more sophisticated real-world contexts. Supportive features include simple sentence structures, 3-4 sentences per page, up to 8 words in most sentences, and moderate photo support. Example: "Learning the Rules" - “One rule tells us to put away supplies. Then we can find supplies the next time.” (pg. 7)

Level 4 (Expanding) texts are longer texts that employ more words per sentence and compound sentences. Supportive features include: mostly simple sentence structures, 5-6 sentences per page, up to 8 words in most sentences, and moderate photo support. Example: "Enforcing Rules" - “People in charge enforce rules. Adults enforce rules at home. Teachers and principals enforce rules at school. Coaches enforce rules in sports. Police officers enforce rules in communities.” (pg. 13)
IB. Vocabulary Usage (specificity of words, from general to specific to technical)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓</td>
<td>❑</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Is vocabulary usage represented as words, phrases, and expressions in context?

B. Is vocabulary usage addressed in the materials for all of the targeted levels of proficiency?

C. Are general, specific, and technical language usage systematically presented throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

(A) Each text in the Early Explorer series provides a brief introduction to the content with key vocabulary introduced visually and then connected with pictures in the text. (B) Vocabulary usage is represented as words, phrases, and expressions in context at all levels. Real photographs clearly represent key concepts of the book with pictures labeled with key vocabulary. (C) General, specific, and technical language usage is systematically addressed throughout the Early Explorers series.

Level 1 Example: "What Is in a Forest?"
"Many trees are in a forest. A tree is alive." There is a photo of a forest. (pg. 6)

Level 2 Example: "All About Trees"
"Both trees have these parts." Buds, leaves, and branches are clearly labeled on the photograph. (pg. 6)

Level 3 Example: "What Are The Parts of a Tree?"
“A tree is a big plant. A tree has many parts. The parts help a tree grow.” The accompanying diagram is a drawing of a tree with the parts clearly labeled. A photograph of a tree with the parts for the student to identify is on the facing page. (pgs. 5, 6)

Level 4 Example: "How Do Trees Grow?"
“A tree grows when the environment is right. First, a root and a stem grow. The root grows into the soil. The root holds the seed in place. The stem grows toward the sun. The seed becomes a sprout.” The key concept vocabulary terms of environment, root, and sprout are in bold print. There is an accompanying diagram labeled with the concept vocabulary. (pg. 7)

Systematic language usage includes: Level 1 (tree, forest); Level 2 (buds, leaves); Level 3 (bark, branches, trunk); and Level 4 (root, seed, sprout).
IC. **Language Control/Conventions** (comprehensibility of language)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>🟢</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>🟢</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>🟢</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Are opportunities to demonstrate language control presented in the materials?

B. Do opportunities to demonstrate language control correspond to all targeted levels of language proficiency?

C. Are opportunities to demonstrate language control systematically presented in the materials in multiple chapters, lessons, or units?

**Justification:** In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

```
(A) The materials present ample opportunity to demonstrate language control. (B) Language control shifts from level to level and provides scaffolded language acquisition (e.g., patterned text, noun-pronoun change, etc.) at all levels. (C) Opportunities to demonstrate language control are systematically presented in the materials in multiple chapters, lessons, and units.

Level 1 Example: "Life at the Beach"
"I see a clam." (pg. 6) "I see a crab." (pg. 8)
Teacher's Guide: “Ask students to turn to pages 2 and 3, and point to each photograph as you say its matching label. Repeat the process, inviting students to echo-read.” (pg. 2)

Level 2 Example: "I Have a Coin"
"I have a penny. I put it in the bank." (pg. 4)
Teacher's Guide: “Then take students on a picture walk. Reinforce the meanings of the previewed words as you talk about the photographs. Also talk about the purse, shoe, backpack, and jar, and make sure students can pronounce each word.” (pg. 2)

Level 3 Example: "Natural Landmarks"
"Many natural landmarks are in the United States. The Grand Canyon is in Arizona. The wind helped to make the canyon." (pg. 6)
Teacher's Guide: “Ask: ‘What are some things in nature that could be landmarks?’ Ask students to respond and create a concept web about natural landmarks. Then read each word and ask students to echo-read.” (pg. 2)

Level 4 Example: "A Healthy Earth"
"Everyone makes trash. A person can make four pounds of trash, or waste, in one day. Look at the graph. How much trash can a person make in one week?” (pg. 7)
Teacher's Guide: “Ask students to point to each photograph as you say its matching label. Repeat the process, inviting students to echo-read. After students Think/Pair/Share what they know about each word, fill in the missing details.” (pg. 2)
```
II. ENGLISH LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY (ELP) STANDARDS

IIA. Presence of WIDA English Language Proficiency Standards

YES NO

A. Are social and instructional language and one or more of the remaining WIDA Standards (the language of Language Arts, Mathematics, Science, and Social Studies) present in the materials?

B. Do the materials systematically integrate Social and Instructional Language and the language of the targeted content area(s)?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

(A) Social and instructional language is present in the Early Explorers series and provides strong support for the the WIDA Standards in the language of Language Arts, Mathematics, Science, and Social Studies. A broad range of content is presented in the primarily nonfiction materials with a heavy focus on mathematics, social studies, and science content. Many of the texts are paired with fiction texts on the same topic at the same developmental level. The text is written to support developmental reading and language acquisition strategies as described. (B) Social and Instructional language is systematically embedded in all texts, Teacher’s Guides, and supporting materials.

Level 3 Example: "What is Round?"
Comprehension Card, Vocabulary - Use direct definitions and descriptions to determine word meaning: “What does the word circle mean in this book? Look for clues on pages 4 and 5.” (Answer: a shape that does not have sides and corners; Clues/evidence: a circle is a shape, a circle does not have sides, a circle does not have corners.)

Teacher’s Guide:
Preview the Book (pg. 2) - Teachers preview the book, encouraging students to interact with the pictures and text on each page as the teacher emphasizes the elements from the page 3 chart that will best support their understanding of the book’s language, concepts, and organization.

Words to Discuss - “Ask students to point to each photograph as you say its matching label.” (pg. 2)

Use Realia - “Show students a globe and a round clock.” (pg. 2)

Spanish Cognates - Each lesson includes cognates. “The English word ‘circle’ sounds like the Spanish word ‘círculo’. Circle and círculo mean the same thing.” (pg.4)

Related Resources (pg. 2)
• “What Is Round?” Audio CD
• Power Tool Flip Chart for Teachers/Comprehension Text-Dependent Question Cards
• Student Bookmark
• Compare and Contrast Poster
• Early Explorers Overview & Assessment Handbook
IIB. Representation of Language Domains

YES  NO
☑  ☐  A. Are the language domains (listening, speaking, reading, and writing) targeted in the materials?
☑  ☐  B. Are the targeted language domains presented within the context of language proficiency levels?
☑  ☐  C. Are the targeted language domains systematically integrated throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

(A) Early Explorers address the language domains of listening, speaking, reading, and writing through small-group guided instruction. Echo-reading, choral reading, retelling, and writing to a prompt are examples of activities included in the lessons. (B) The targeted language domains are appropriately presented within the context of all language proficiency levels and the language domains are (B) systematically integrated throughout the materials and represent all stages of language proficiency.

Level 1 - Listening Example: "Soft and Hard" Teacher's Guide, Introduce the Book - "Then read each word and ask students to echo-read." (pg. 2)
Additional Resource: "Soft and Hard" Audio CD

Level 2 - Speaking Example: "How Many Muffins?" Teacher's Guide, Use the Graphic Organizer to Summarize - "Ask students to think about their reading. Say: Look at our T-chart. What can we add to help answer each question? Record ideas students share from the story. Choral-read the entire chart. Then ask students to use the graphic organizer to tell the story to a partner." (pg. 4)

Level 3 - Reading Example: "Looking at Matter" Teacher’s Guide, Observe and Prompt Reading Strategies - "After the supportive introduction, students should be able to read all or most of the book on their own. Observe students as they read. Take note of the graphophonic, syntactic, and semantic cues they use to make sense of the text and self-correct. Prompt individual students who have difficulty problem-solving independently, but be careful not to prompt English-language learners too quickly. They may need more time to process the text as they rely on their first language for comprehension." (pg. 5)
Listening Example: "Looking at Matter" Teacher's Guide - "Ask students to point to each photograph as you say its matching label." (pg. 2). Additional Resource: “Looking at Matter” Audio CD

Level 4 - Writing Example: “Working with Estimation” Teacher's Guide, Write to a Text Prompt - "Say: We read about things to estimate and measure. Now write about a time you estimated or measured something. When you are finished, read your writing to a partner." (pg. 8)
III. LEVELS OF LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY

IIIA. Differentiation of Language (for ELP levels)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Do the materials differentiate between the language proficiency levels?

B. Is differentiation of language proficiency developmentally and linguistically appropriate for the designated language levels?

C. Is differentiation of language systematically addressed throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

(A) Early Explorers differentiate between the language proficiency levels and reading development levels. The books are precisely leveled to take into account word count at the sentence, page, and book level. Sensory, graphic, and interactive supports enable students of all levels to process the text. (B) The supports are age-level, grade-level, and language proficiency level appropriate. The Early Explorers materials strictly adhere to the previously described reading and language proficiency scaffolds. (C) The differentiation of language proficiency is linguistically appropriate for the designated language levels. The following text examples progress gradually through the levels of reading and language development. The Teacher’s Guides demonstrate how the differentiation is varying levels of teacher support appropriate for the designated language levels. Differentiation is addressed systematically throughout the materials.

Examples:
Level 1: "A Bear Cub Grows" - “A bear cub can swim.” (pg. 12), “A bear cub can grow.” (pg. 14) The sentence structure remains the same with the word that changes pictorially previewed before reading and also highlighted in the text.

Level 2: "Helping Animals" - “All animals need food. People can help animals get food. A boy gives his rabbit some food.” (pg. 6) The sentence structure pattern repeats throughout the book. A photograph of a boy giving his rabbit food accompanies the text.

Level 3: "Food in the Forest" - “All animals need food to live. The food keeps animals healthy.” (pg. 4) Sentence length and word count increase with the language proficiency levels. Content words forest, animals, and healthy are introduced.

Level 4: "A Healthy Earth" - “Dirty rivers and streets are examples of pollution. Pollution can harm plants and animals. Certain types of pollution can harm people, too.” (pg. 5) This example provides specific technical content through multiple connected sentences in a paragraph. A glossary is provided as are charts and graphs to illustrate the content.
IIIB. Scaffolding Language Development (from ELP level to ELP level)

YES  NO

A. Do the materials provide scaffolding supports for students to advance within a proficiency level?

B. Do the materials provide scaffolding supports for students to progress from one proficiency level to the next?

C. Are scaffolding supports presented systematically throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

(A) Adequate supports for students to advance within a proficiency level are provided in both the student texts (sentence structure, graphic and visual representations, glossaries) and the Teacher's Guides (explanation, modeling, guided practice, and feedback). (B) The scaffolding supports become more sophisticated to match the advancement in proficiency levels. (C) The scaffolding supports are presented systematically throughout each level and from level to level in both the student materials and Teacher's Guides. Examples:

Level 1: "A Bear Cub Grows" - The essential vocabulary is represented with photographs: bear cub, grow, swim, and eat in the student text. The Teacher's Guide has these directions: "Ask students to point to each photograph as you say its matching label. Repeat the process, inviting students to echo-read." (pg. 4)

Level 2: "What Is in a Forest?" - "You can see bears in a forest. A bear is alive, too." (pg. 10) An accompanying fiction text, "Fox in the Forest", at the same reading level and language proficiency level allows students to further practice Tier 2 vocabulary and language. The Teacher's Guide provides these directions, "Draw a circle on the board and write the word 'forest' in the center. Read the word and say: ‘We named things in a forest. What are some of the things we named?’ As students respond, create a concept web about a forest. Then read each word and ask students to echo-read." (pg. 2)

Level 3: "What Are the Parts of a Tree?" - "The trunk is the biggest part of a tree. The trunk supports the branches. The branches grow from the trunk. The trunk gets water from the roots. Then the trunk brings water to the whole tree." (pgs. 8-9) Words are on both pages of the spread with a real picture of a tree and a diagram with the parts of the tree labeled. The Teacher's Guide provides these directions: "This page has a labeled diagram. A labeled diagram is a drawing that shows different parts. Label name the parts of the diagram. What does this diagram show? (the parts of a tree) What part of the tree is under the ground? (roots)" (pg. 4)

Level 4: "How Do Trees Grow?" - The text on each page is denser and more sophisticated. Support includes bolded Tier 3 words and more advanced graphic illustrations. Sample text: "A tree grows when the environment is right. First, a root and a stem grow. The root grows into the soil. The root holds the seed in place. The stem grows toward the sun. The seed becomes a sprout." The concept vocabulary "environment", "root", and "sprout" are in bold print. There is an accompanying diagram labeled with this concept vocabulary (pg. 7). In the Teacher's Guide, graphic organizers become more advanced and shift to greater student responsibility for completion. (pg. 2)
IV. STRANDS OF MODEL PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

IVA. Language Functions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Do the materials include a range of language functions?

B. Do the language functions attach to a context (i.e. are they incorporated into a communicative goal or activity)?

C. Are language functions presented comprehensively to support the progression of language development?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

(A) Early Explorers texts include a range of language functions. Students are required to communicate messages in a variety of ways with varying level of support. (B) The language functions in Early Explorers attach to a specific context in all content areas of Reading/Language Arts, Social and Instructional Communication, Mathematics, Science, and Social Studies. They also incorporate into a communicative goal or activity related to each content area. (C) Language functions are presented comprehensively to support the progression of language development from lower levels to higher levels of proficiency, differing in the amount of complexity and discourse and expected vocabulary usage. The progression of language development is represented both within levels and from level to level. Examples below are representative of all four levels:

Level 2: "What Is in A Forest?" - Teacher's Guide asks students to “Draw a circle on the board and write the word ‘forest’ in the center. Then read the word and say: ‘We named things in a forest. What are some of the things we named?’ As students respond, create a concept web about a forest. Then read each word and ask students to echo-read.” (pg. 2) After reading, students are asked to use the graphic organizer to summarize the reading. “Ask students to think about their reading. Ask: ‘Do we need to add any forest things to the web?’ Record words students suggest. Choral-read the entire web. Then ask students to use the graphic organizer to tell a partner about the book.” (pg. 4)

Level 4: "What Are the Parts of a Tree?" - The Teacher’s Guide asks students to answer text-dependent questions. First the teacher models using context and text features to figure out vocabulary words, then the students practice the strategy. The Teacher’s Guide includes explicit “teacher talk” and sets clear expectations for student response. Model: “Use the first vocabulary question on the question card. Say: ‘I will read the question to figure out what to do. What does the word trunk mean in this book? Let’s look for clues on page 8. This question asks me to figure out what the word trunk means. I will look for a trunk in the photograph, too.’ Turn to page 8. Say: ‘I see the big trunk in the photograph. The author says the trunk is the biggest part of a tree. This definition answers the question. The answer makes sense. I have found the answer in the text.” (pg. 6) Guide: “Ask students to answer the other questions on the question card. Use the Power Tool Flip Chart and the Student Bookmark to provide additional modeling as needed. Remind students to ask themselves: ‘What is the question asking? How can I find the answer? Does my answer make sense? How do I know?’” (pg. 6)
YES NO

Higher Order Thinking

☑ ☐ D. Are opportunities to engage in higher order thinking present for students of various levels of English language proficiency?

☑ ☐ E. Are opportunities for engaging in higher order thinking systematically addressed in the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

(D) Opportunities are present to engage in higher-order thinking for students of all levels of English language proficiency. Opportunities are based on the student texts and described in the Teacher’s Guides and Comprehension Text-Dependent Question (CTDR) cards. The CTDR cards provide questions from each of Bloom’s Levels of Thinking. Each text is accompanied by a CTDR card which includes four levels of comprehension: Find It! Level 1 Comprehension; Look Closer! Level 2 Comprehension; Prove It! Level 3 Comprehension; and Take It Apart! Level 4 Comprehension. (E) Opportunities for engaging in higher-order thinking are systematically addressed at each level in the materials as evidenced by the progression of thinking skills on each of the CTDR cards that accompany each text (example below) and systematically through the levels of proficiency. Examples:

Level 2: “Three Kinds of Water” - Comprehension Card
Find It! • Identify facts and details: You can put ice in your . . . (juice, page 12)
Look Closer! Identify stated main idea: What sentence tells the main idea for page 6? (“This water is a liquid.”)
Prove It! Draw conclusions: “Look at page 8. Water can be used in many ways. What clues show how water can be used? (you can swim in water, you can wash in water, you can drink the water)”
Take It Apart! Evaluate author’s purpose: “The author shows three photographs on page 13. Why does the author show three photographs? (so the reader can see three ways to use ice)”

Level 3: “Water Works” - Comprehension Question Card
Find It! Identify facts and details: “Water can make . . . (energy, page 12)”
Look Closer! Identify stated main idea: “What sentence tells the main idea for page 9? (“Some towns store water.”)”
Prove It! Use graphic features to interpret information: “Look at the labeled diagram on page 11. How does water flow into a house? (Answer: through a pipe; Clues/evidence: the diagram shows a well with a long pipe that goes from the top of the ground to water beneath the ground)”
Take It Apart! Evaluate author’s purpose: “The author uses a labeled diagram on page 15. Why did the author use this labeled diagram? (so the reader knows the names of the machines used to make electricity)”

Level 4: “It’s Earth Day!” - Comprehension Question Card
Find It! Identify facts and details: “The first Earth Day was a . . . (success, page 9)”
Look Closer! Identify cause and effect: “People did not worry about Earth because . . . (they thought Earth would always be safe and clean, page 6):”
Prove It! Make inferences: “People were not worried about pollution before 1970. What clues show this? (Answer: before Earth Day, people did not worry about Earth (pgs. 6-7)”
Take It Apart! Evaluate author’s purpose: “Look at page 6. The author uses a photograph. Why does the author use a photograph? (so readers can see what smoke looks like)”
IVB. Content Stem

Coverage and Specificity of Example Content Topics

A. Do examples cover a wide range of topics typically found in state and local academic content standards?

B. Are example topics accessible to English language learners of the targeted level(s) of English language proficiency?

C. Are example topics systematically presented throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

(A) The topics presented in Early Explorers cover a wide range of the topics typically found in state and local academic content standards. The Mathematics and English Language Arts topics correspond to topics from the Common Core State Standards and many state standards, the Science topics support the National Science Education Standards, and the Social Studies topics support the National Curriculum Standards for Social Studies. Language Arts standards are further supported by the pairing of nonfiction and fiction texts. (B) Example topics are made accessible to English Language earners of the targeted levels of English language proficiency through sensory support, graphic support, and interactive support as well as a gradual progression of reading and language proficiency. (C) Example topics are systematically presented throughout the materials with gradually increasing levels of language proficiency, reading development, and cognitive abilities required.

A representative sample of titles from each content area and level includes:

Mathematics:
Level 1: "I Have a Coin", "We Get the Cookies"
Level 2: "We Have Coins", "We Subtract"
Level 3: "How Many Muffins?", "I Have Fifty Cents, What is Round?"
Level 4: "Working with Estimation", "Numbers Big and Small"

Social Studies:
Level 1: "Families Have Rules", "A Map of My House"
Level 2: "Rules at School", "Near and Far"
Level 3: "Learning the Rules", "Mapping the Way"
Level 4: "Enforcing the Rules", "Finding Africa"

Science:
Level 1: "What Is in a Forest?", "Food in the Forest", "A Bear Cub Grows"
Level 2: "All About Trees", "Soft and Hard", "Three Kinds of Water"
Level 3: "What Are The Parts of a Tree?", "Looking at Matter"
Level 4: "How Do Trees Grow?", "A Healthy Earth", "It’s Earth Day!"

Examples of Nonfiction/Fiction Pairs:
"We Have Coins"/"The Yard Sale"; "What Is in a Forest?"/"Fox in the Forest"
"Mapping the Way"/"Sam Finds the Way"

This example is typical of the mathematics that support the Common Core Standards:
Level 2: "We Subtract" - "They gave away eight cookies. How many cookies do they have now?" (pg. 5) The illustration shows a pan of 12 cookies with 8 of them crossed out. There is also a numeric representation of the question: 12 - 8 = 4.
Accessibility to Grade Level Content

D. Is linguistically and developmentally appropriate grade level content present in the materials?

E. Is grade level content accessible for the targeted levels of language proficiency?

F. Is the grade level content systematically presented throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

(D) Linguistically and developmentally-appropriate grade-level content is presented in the materials as evidenced by the examples presented in previous questions, and in the following examples of representative proficiency levels. The student text in the following examples is developmentally appropriate in that it presents familiar concepts in a familiar environment. Illustrations are supportive of linguistically appropriate grade-level content, gradually progressing from level to level. (E) Grade-level content is accessible for the targeted levels of language proficiency through linguistically- and developmentally-appropriate texts and graphic, sensory, and interactive supports. (F) The content is systematically presented throughout the materials within each level and from level to level.

In this example, the content meets grade-level Social Studies standards:
Level 1: "Jobs at School" - "Look at the school. Who works in the school?" (pg. 4)
Level 2: "Our School Community" - "Look at our teacher. Our teacher works in our school. Our teacher works in our community." (pg. 8)
Level 3: "Getting Ready for School" - "Some boys and girls take their lunch to school. This boy is making his lunch. He will put his lunch in his backpack." (pg. 10)

The following examples provide evidence of the systematic presentation of content in the materials.
Level 1: "Jobs at School"
- Sensory Support: Use of realia for items used at school (Teacher’s Guide, pg. 2)
- Graphic Support: Important vocabulary illustrated (Student text, pgs. 2-3); real photographs illustrate the text (throughout)
- Interactive Support: Picture walk to preview text, (Teacher’s Guide, pg. 2)
Level 2: "Our School Community"
- Sensory Support: Use of realia (Teacher’s Guide, pg. 2)
- Graphic Support: Important vocabulary illustrated (Student text, pgs. 2-3); Real photographs illustrate the text (throughout)
- Interactive Support: Picture walk to preview text, (Teacher’s Guide, pg. 2)
Level 3: "Getting Ready for School"
- Sensory Support: Use of realia that includes items presently used and historically used (Teacher’s Guide, pg. 2)
- Graphic Support: Important vocabulary illustrated (Student text, pgs. 2-3); Real photographs illustrate the text (throughout)
- Interactive Support: Student completes graphic organizer with teacher to compare present and past.
Level 4: "Communities Then and Now"
- Graphic Support: Photographs of a city (Tokyo) long ago and today and a map (pg. 7); Real photographs illustrate the text (throughout)
- Interactive Support – Student completes graphic organizer to compare communities then and now.
IVC. INSTRUCTIONAL SUPPORTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sensory Support**

A. Are sensory supports, which may include visual supports, present and varied in the materials?

B. Are sensory supports relevant to concept attainment and presented in a manner that reinforces communicative goals for the targeted levels of proficiency?

C. Are sensory supports systematically presented throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

---

(A) Sensory supports are present and varied in the materials within each proficiency level and across the levels. The sensory supports used to assist students in accessing content necessary for classroom understanding and communication are applicable across all standards and include realia, pictures, photographs, diagrams and drawings, physical action, audio recordings of texts, talking e-books, Interactive Whiteboard formats, and illustrated vocabulary. Also present are sensory supports specific to the content areas such as geometric models, measuring tools, coins, natural materials, and maps. (B) Sensory supports are relevant to concept attainment and presented in a manner that reinforces communicative goals for the targeted levels of proficiency. (C) Sensory supports are systematically presented throughout the materials and are varied from lesson to lesson and level to level.

Examples:

Level 1: “Soft and Hard” - “A bat is not soft. A bat is hard.” (pg. 10) The text describing a familiar object, a bat, is illustrated with a photograph of a bat. The word bat is highlighted and was introduced pictorially on page 2. The Teacher’s Guide builds background with realia and physical action: “Gather objects that are soft or hard, such as a pencil, ruler, sweater, and cotton ball. Say: ‘We will read a book about soft things and hard things. Choose one soft item. Touch and squeeze it, pass it around the group, and put it to one side saying: The ___ is soft.’ Repeat the process with a hard item. Ask students to sort the remaining items by soft or hard. Finally, invite them to name other objects that are soft or hard.” (pg. 2) “Act out using something that is soft or hard. Ask a partner to guess what you are using.” (pg. 8) Additional Resources include an Audio CD, Talking E-Book, and Interactive Whiteboard format.

Level 3: “What Is Round?” - “A circle is a shape. A circle does not have sides.” This is illustrated with a drawn circle and photographs of things that are round, a cookie, and a plate. (pg. 4) “The Teacher’s Guide builds background with realia: ‘Show students a globe and a round clock. Say: ‘We will read a book about things that are round. Some round things are circles. This clock face is a circle. Some round things are spheres. This ball is a sphere.’ Ask students to think/pair/share other things that are circles or spheres.” (pg. 2) The Teacher’s Guide also directs the teacher to use physical movement to help students read more fluently: “Ask students to turn to page 6. First, read the author’s question in a flat voice. Hold your hand level while you read it. Discuss how this makes the question sound. Then read the question again, moving your hand upward at the end as you move your voice to a higher pitch. Ask students to echo-read and move their hands along with yours.” (pg. 10) Additional Resources include an Audio CD, Talking E-Book, and Interactive Whiteboard format.
**YES**  **NO**  **Graphic Support**

D.  Are graphic supports present and varied in the materials?

E.  Are graphic supports relevant to concept attainment and presented in a manner that reinforces communicative goals for the targeted proficiency levels?

F.  Are graphic supports systematically presented throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

(D) Early Explorers texts are rich in graphic support including graphic organizers. They are clearly organized and supportive to organize information for retelling or writing. (E) Graphic supports are relevant to concept attainment and reinforce communicative goals for the targeted proficiency levels. They are used to build background knowledge, record information during and after reading, and for retelling and organizing writing. (F) Graphic supports are presented systematically throughout the materials for all levels of reading development and language proficiency, shifting from high teacher support at the lower levels to more student independence at Level 4. For example, Level 1 - echo read, Level 2 - choral read, Level 3 - use the web to summarize, and Level 4 - use the web to confirm predictions. Examples:

**Level 1:** “Soft and Hard” Teacher’s Guide - “Write the words ‘Soft and Hard’ on the board. Underline each word. Read the words and ask students to help you list things that are soft or hard. As students respond, write the words under the appropriate heading. Then read each word and ask students to echo-read.” (pg. 2)

**Level 2:** “Three Kinds of Water” Teacher’s Guide - “Draw a circle on the board and write the word ‘water’ in the center. Read the word. Ask: ‘What are some words we might see in a book about water?’ As students respond, create a concept web about water. Then read each word and ask students to echo-read.” (pg. 2)

**Level 3:** “All About Trees” Teacher’s Guide - “Create an overhead transparency of the ‘All About Trees’ graphic organizer on page 12 or draw it on the board. Say: ‘Nonfiction books have lots of information. We look for the most important ideas. Then we summarize the information. To summarize, we put the ideas together into one sentence about the book.’ Lead students through the book and find the big idea on each page. Record the big ideas on the graphic organizer, then read it aloud and invite students to echo-read. Then together compose a sentence that summarizes the information in the book, such as “All trees are alike in many ways.” (pg. 7)

**Level 4:** “Finding Africa” Teacher’s Guide - “Draw a two-column chart with the headings ‘I think . . .’ and ‘Ifind out . . .’ Ask students what they think they might see in Africa. Write students’ ideas in the ‘I think . . .’ column of the prediction chart. Then read each entry, prefacing it with the phrase ‘I think Africa has . . .’ and ask students to echo-read.” (pg. 2) After reading, “Ask students to think about their reading. Say: ‘Look at our prediction chart. What did we see in Africa?’ Write the words students call out in the ‘I find out . . .’ column of the chart. Then choral-read each entry, prefacing it with the phrase ‘Africa has . . .’ Ask students to use the graphic organizer to tell a partner about the book.” (pg. 5)
G. Are interactive supports present and varied in the materials?  

H. Are interactive supports present and relevant to concept attainment for the targeted proficiency levels?  

I. Are interactive supports varied and systematically presented in the materials?  

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

(G) Many varied interactive supports are provided in the materials. Explicit instruction which includes explanation, modeling, guided practice, and feedback are outlined in the Teacher Guide with explicit teacher talk to support the students. Talking e-books and online Interactive Whiteboard formats are available for each Early Explorer student text. Each lesson also provides Spanish cognates so that students whose native language is Spanish can see the connections between Spanish and English words. Student interaction with the teacher guides instruction while interaction with peers is built into the lessons to practice social and academic language. (H) Interactive supports are present and relevant to concept attainment for the targeted proficiency levels. The consistent explicit instruction before, during, and after reading is provided in each Teacher’s Guide. (I) Interactive supports are varied and systematically presented in Early Explorers. There is a gradual release of responsibility to the student as the student becomes more proficient with language.

Level 2: “Three Kinds of Water” Teacher’s Guide, Spanish Cognates - “Ask students to point to each photograph as you say its matching label. Repeat the process, inviting students to echo-read. After students Think/Pair/Share what they know about each word, fill in any missing details. Say: ‘We will see these words in the book.’ Ask students to point to each photograph as you say its matching label. Repeat the process, inviting students to echo-read. After students Think/Pair/Share what they know about each word, fill in any missing details. Say: ‘We will see these words in the book.’” (pg. 2) “Remind students to use other reading strategies they are learning as well, such as checking the pictures and returning to the beginning of the sentence if something doesn’t sound right.” (pg. 4)

Level 4: “A Healthy Earth”, Teacher’s Guide, Write a Description - “Let’s figure out the cause-and-effect relationships in ‘A Healthy Earth’. Ask students to turn to page 6. Say: ‘We read how pollution can start. First someone drops trash. Dropping trash is a cause.’ Write ‘dropping trash’ in the first Cause box on the graphic organizer. Then say: ‘The effect of dropping trash is that trash creates pollution.’ Write ‘creates pollution’ in the first Effect box on the graphic organizer.” (pg. 8)

To view interactive Whiteboard books, please see http://benchmarkuniverse.com. One of the features of the interactive Whiteboard books is the opportunity to highlight text or specific aspects of text as well as to hear it read aloud.
Appendix

I. **Performance Definitions** – the criteria (linguistic complexity, vocabulary usage, and language control) that shape each of the six levels of English language proficiency that frame the English language proficiency standards.
   
   IA. **Linguistic Complexity** – the amount and quality of speech or writing for a given situation
   IB. **Vocabulary Usage** – the specificity of words (from general to technical) or phrases for a given context
   IC. **Language Control/Conventions** – the comprehensibility and understandability of the communication for a given context

II. **English Language Proficiency Standards** – the language expectations of English language learners at the end of their English language acquisition journey across the language domains, the four main subdivisions of language.
   
   IIA. Five WIDA ELP Standards:
   1. English language learners **communicate** for Social and Instructional purposes within the school setting.
   2. English language learners **communicate** information, ideas, and concepts necessary for academic success in the content area of Language Arts.
   3. English language learners **communicate** information, ideas, and concepts necessary for academic success in the content area of Mathematics.
   4. English language learners **communicate** information, ideas, and concepts necessary for academic success in the content area of Science.
   5. English language learners **communicate** information, ideas, and concepts necessary for academic success in the content area of Social Studies.

   IIB. Domains:
   - **Listening** – process, understand, interpret, and evaluate spoken language in a variety of situations
   - **Speaking** – engage in oral communication in a variety of situations for a variety of audiences
   - **Reading** – process, understand, interpret, and evaluate written language, symbols and text with understanding and fluency
   - **Writing** – engage in written communication in a variety of situations for a variety of audiences

III. **Levels of English Language Proficiency** - The five language proficiency levels (1-Entering, 2-Beginning, 3-Developing, 4-Expanding, 5- Bridging) outline the progression of language development in the acquisition of English. The organization of the standards into strands of Model Performance Indicators (MPIs) illustrates the continuum of language development.
   
   IIIA. **Differentiation** – providing instruction in a variety of ways to meet the educational needs of students at different proficiency levels
   IIIB. **Scaffolding** – building on already acquired skills and knowledge from level to level of language proficiency based on increased linguistic complexity, vocabulary usage, and language control through the use of supports.
IV. Strands of Model Performance Indicators – examples that describe a specific level of English language proficiency for a language domain. Each Model Performance Indicator has three elements: Language Function, Content Stem, and Support

IVA. Language Functions – the first of the three elements in model performance indicators indicates how ELLs are to process and use language to demonstrate their English language proficiency.
• Context – the extent to which language functions are presented comprehensively, socially and academically in materials
• Higher Order Thinking – cognitive processing that involves learning complex skills such as critical thinking and problem solving.

IVB. Content Stem – the second element relates the context or backdrop for language interaction within the classroom. The language focus for the content may be social, instructional or academic depending on the standard.

IVC. Instructional Support – instructional strategies or tools used to assist students in accessing content necessary for classroom understanding or communication and to help construct meaning from oral or written language. Three categories of instructional supports include sensory, graphic and interactive supports.
• Sensory support – A type of scaffold that facilitates students’ deeper understanding of language or access to meaning through the visual or other senses.
• Graphic support – A type of scaffold to help students demonstrate their understanding of ideas and concepts without having to depend on or produce complex and sustained discourse.
• Interactive support – A type of scaffold to help students communicate and facilitate their access to content, such as working in pairs or groups to confirm prior knowledge, using their native language to clarify, or incorporating technology into classroom activities.